Master's Theses and Doctoral Dissertations

Master's Theses, and Doctoral Dissertations, and
Graduate Capstone Projects

2018

Circuits of race: Consumption of colorism in Nivea's "Natural Fairness" campaign

Gabrielle Burgess-Smith

Follow this and additional works at: http://commons.emich.edu/theses

 Part of the Marketing Commons, and the Race, Ethnicity and Post-Colonial Studies Commons

Circuits of Race: Consumption of Colorism in Nivea's "Natural Fairness" Campaign

by

Gabrielle Burgess-Smith

Thesis

Submitted to the Department of Communications

Eastern Michigan University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements

for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

in

Communications

Thesis Committee:

Keon Pettiway, Ph.D., Chair

Lolita Cummings Carson, M.A., APR

Raymond Quiel, Ph.D.

March 15, 2018

Ypsilanti, Michigan

Dedication

"Until the lions have their own historians, the history of the hunt will always glorify the hunter."

~Chinua Achebe

This thesis has been one of the most difficult experiences I have ever gone through. However, in the same mix, it has been one of the most liberating developments in my 23 years. My will to know myself better inside and out was the inspiration behind this work. What we all must know is the journey of self-discovery is never-ending…it's always in progress. Though this work is now published, as a result of an end-process, there is still so much more to be written. This work is not done, and I encourage you to stay tuned for future works, as it helps us all navigate through a world that persistently tears us away from our core.

I hope this work inspires other to be more cognitive of the consumption process that is happening knowingly and even unbeknownst. How much of yourself is truly you and how much of yourself is a combined method to cope with the traumas endured? We all must realize our individual and collective power in order to speak up against the microaggressions and assaults our brothers and sisters of past, present, and future have fallen and continue to fall victim to. Public relations and marketing are power markets that have the ability to infiltrate a permeable culture and in turn a permeable mind. By revealing this process through this manuscript, knowledge is gained, but it doesn't start nor begins here. I am just the lion's historian.

With every ounce of breath in my body and being in my spirit, I give undying gratitude to my Lord and Savior. Without Him/Her I am nothing and I have been granted the spirit of persistence and used as a vessel to get through this series. It has been a battle getting through this work, but that's when you know what you're producing is truly needed as a contribution to the field. Without the constant motivation, prayers, and "tough talks" from my mother, Rana Smith,

and grandmother, Cordelia Smith, I would probably be in a fetal position mumbling gibberish.

Their unwavering love helped me find the light in the dark of days (even when I had periods of

enduring severe stress and my attitude showed brightly). Their love and teachings have carried

me far and there is no way I can ever properly thank them for all they have done and continue to

do for me. Together, they raised a woman I am in love with. Me. Love you both, infinity <3 .

Without my advisor, Dr. Keon Pettiway, this work would be non-existent. My advisor has

devoted an incredulous amount of time, knowledge, and patience. I may have been a difficult

student at times, but I have truly had the opportunity to learn from the best. My committee

member Lolita Cummings Carson, APR, has been a true angel in human form as she has been

with me since my first days as an eager, 17-year-old freshman. The one who helped ignite my

true passion for the field of public relations and continues to rekindle the fire in me for the field.

Dr. Raymond Quiel, my other committee member, inspired me to see the world with new eyes,

and in order to see the world with new eyes, you must look past what your eyes reveal onto you.

He inspired my passion for wellness and to live a meaningful life for myself and others. My

mentor, Dr. Chiara Hensley, has revealed so much to me about myself in such a short amount of

time. It is because of her, my third eye has reawakened, and I am seeing life much more clearly.

Our motivational talks fill me as though I am on Cloud 9. I aspire to be half the mentor she is as

she has poured so much into me. I would like to give a thank you to my father, George Wilson,

who passed, July 2, 2017, during the production of this paper. I am thankful for the time we were

able to spend together.

  Lastly, I would like to thank Eastern Michigan University for the opportunities bestowed

onto me. I have definitely earned my degrees from this university, and I have learned so much

from the family of students, staff, and administrators. All people, including a plethora of others, have helped me through this process and I am deeply appreciative.

With love,

The Lion's Historian

(Gabrielle Burgess-Smith)

Abstract

Colorism is not a Black-White or dark issue; it is a global issue that has emerged into a

dynamical power force dividing people from people and, in turn, people from self. It is not solely

subjected as a battled issue in America, but it is a global phenomenon where support is gained

from all corners of the world—resulting in a worldwide denigration. Psychological and

physiological turmoil comes in forms of anxiety, depression, reduced wages, loss of self, and

privilege. The blinding processes of colorism through the effects of social media advertisements

is a two-way communication process. Through a systematic analyzation of a social network-led

campaign of the Visibly Fairer product by Nivea, a renowned body-care brand, colorism is

assessed as a manipulative, global cultivation that is used as a business model to drive

consumership. The circuit of culture is used to thoroughly explicate an in-depth exploratory view

of two campaigns from the perspective of the producers and the receivers. The internalization

process of manipulative business models, such as Nivea, has internal and external effects on the

public. Larger implications are for researchers to further investigate articulatory models to

expand theories of public relations from critical cultural studies perspectives.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction

Colorism has acquiesced minds into believing that certain shades of skin tone are more acceptable based upon westernized Eurocentric standards of beauty. Thus, colorism functions as a site of power and difference. As a label marker, it assigns stereotypes to people based upon skin color from light to dark (Johnson & Matthew, 2015). As a form of privilege, colorism both grants and creates barriers for economic, social, and political access. For, instance, as Paul Finkelman (2013) writes in "The Origins of Colorism in Early American Law," "Slaves of mixed ancestry often asserted freedom based on their color, suing to end their servitude. People of mixed ancestry were far more likely to make freedom claims, and they were far more likely to win them. The vast majority of slaves never had any legal claim to freedom. They were born into slavery and died in slavery" (Finkelman, p. 37). "There were, after all, only a few potential freedom claims. These included: residence in a free jurisdiction; manumission of a maternal ancestor; manumission of the individual claiming freedom; and a claim that the person had a white or Indian maternal ancestor and was thus not a slave because only the children of black women could be slaves" (Norwood, 2014, p. 37). As a rite of passage, colorism functions as a process of socialization in a White dominant culture (Wilder, 2015). In addition to labeling people, assigning privilege, and socializing into a Eurocentric standard of beauty, colorism also functions as a form of psychosis, particularly self-esteem and self-efficacy among African Americans (Fultz, 2014; Thompson & Keith, 2001). Thus, it is important to examine the global effects and impact of colorism in public culture.

The destruction of the Black body is more than generations of physical abuse, it is mental as well. However, the cognitive reconstructing endured penetrated a mental osmosing that affected not just Black folks, but all. It bowed minds down to the acceptance of color

hierarchy in a Eurocentric America. The process used is known as colorism. According to

Meghan Burke (2008) , "Colorism is the allocation of privilege and disadvantage according to

the lightness or darkness of one's skin" (p. 17).

Mass marketing goes beyond product acceptance, but infiltrates a permeable culture

(Hunter, 2007), and colorism perpetuates a fallacy that consumers may be internalizing through

public relations and marketing business tactics, such as media ads. The intersection of

internalized colonial values juxtaposed with the cult of the new global beauty has brought about

an extended, "new-age" impact on culture and tradition. Hence, the exportation of beauty

products valorizes white beauty and glamorize anglo-saxon features. It has become normal for

other countries to feed into this westernized beauty standard. One of the many reasons that aid

into the cultivation of colorism are widely exported U.S. cultural products. However, the U.S.A.

is not solely selling products, it is selling a way of life (Hunter, 2007).

Korea has the highest plastic surgery percentage (Hunter, 2007). Majority of surgeries

undergone are for double eyelid surgeries. This type of surgery Westernizes their eyes. In Saudi

Arabia, Uganda, and Brazil, skin bleaching creams are more than common. In Mexico City, it is

not out of the ordinary to receive a nose job as a graduation present (Hunter, 2007). Colorism

comes in many forms. It is not solely subjected as a battled issue in America, but it is a global

phenomenon where support is gained from all corners of the world -- resulting in a "worldwide

denigration" (Gabrielle, 2008).

The ideological cultivation of color has been harvesting since the inception of sin. More

than 200 years post slavery, and the psychosocial impact of racism both on an inter- and intra-

level has tainted the minds of Black men and women and an internal and external suffering has

been endured as a result that feeds into the paradox of skin color (Hoschild & Weaver, 2007).

The fruitage of this perpetuating ideological social construct has birthed more perverse psychological turmoil in the 21st century age of media advertisements (Mathews & Johnson, 2015). This is a perpetuating lie that the public are internalizing through public relations and marketing business tactics through media ads.

In Asia, in 2016, Qiaobi launched a "racist" advertisement for laundry detergent (The Drum, 2016). The ad features a Black man with white paint speckles on him who enters a community laundromat. An Asian woman, who was already occupying the space, approaches the Black man and puts detergent in his mouth - Qiaobi. She then stuffs the man into the washer machine. After seconds pass, the once Black man emerges a light-skinned Asian with all traces of paint splatters gone. The advertisement ends with the woman looking up at the man starry eyed (The Drum - Twitter, 2016).

In 2017, Dove released an advertisement on their U.S. Facebook page promoting body wash. The ad was a three second gif featuring three women. The ad appeared to show a woman undergoing a transformational change from a darker shade to a lighter shade (Dove, 2017). Key publics noticed this transformation that eluded to colorism in the most implicit and explicit of ways. The uproar was heard from those who were followers of Dove on social media and from those who were not. The ad that was originally published on Facebook made its way to Twitter, Instagram, and a host of other media platforms. It became widespread as a result of social media. Thus, public relations campaigns like Dove indicate that colorism circulates through health and beauty products among both intended and unintended audiences and gains public responses. Put together, these historical and contemporary cases demonstrate that colorism and racism have a long, less than amicable relationship in advertisements and public relations. Thus,

it warrants a continual critique of the formation of colorism through processes such as public relations.

The internet spans so much farther and with the way information is disseminated throughout social media and other technological formats, no one is left untouched. The more knowledge gained when it comes to understanding how mass media cultivates lies, one can be more aware of their authentic social identity, how colorism is a racial formation, and how complicit behavior perpetuates the false ideology that is passed down generation to generation.

Chapter 2: Literature Review and Purpose Statement

Colorism in Global Cultural Contexts

Colorism is a distinction of privileging light skin tones above those of dark tones. It has

no direct correlation to race but emphasis on light and dark skin tones. Within the Black

community, colorism is a generational mental takeover that privileges light skin over dark skin.

It is a social concept where society offers substantial privileges to those of a lighter hue (Hunter,

2007). Privileges vary considerably from making more money in diverse occupations to having

higher educational opportunities, which in turn affect the status of living. It discriminates people

based upon their physiognomy (Harris, 1999). Even though people can be of the same ethnic

background, color is a different component in and of itself that has the potential to segregate a

marginalized group even further (Hunter, 2007).

Historically, colorism stems from European colonialism and slavery in the Americas.

Both forms were used to emulate and give praise to whiteness culturally, ideologically,

economically, and even aesthetically. It produced an elite-ness within the Black class by

European standards and likeness. Slave culture from both continents implanted the colorific

idea of color hierarchy by granting exceptional privileges to slaves of lighter skin complexions.

Privileges included working in the house as opposed to the field, the opportunity to learn how to

read, and even a chance of manumission (Hunter, 2007). In Africa, it was used as a form of

apartheid, which was a system of lawful segregation, based upon race (Harris, 1999).

Colorism has also impacted psychological conception of one's self-esteem. Though

African Americans, according to the Rosenberg Global Self-Esteem Scale (RSES), collectively

have a higher self-esteem than Whites and Latinos, especially according to gender (Phinney,

1997), this is not the case for Africans. Juxtaposing this disparity of skin color using RSES,

there is a self-esteem issue in Africa (Makhubela & Mashegoane, 2017). Not to mention, this self-esteem crisis could stem from the new world post-apartheid that Africans are still acclimating themselves to.

The social cognitive theory gives a deeper exploratory perspective of colorism. The social cognitive theory states that it is at the nexus of cognitive, vicarious, self-regulatory, and self-reflective processes. For instance, Bandura (2001) states, "Most external influences affect behavior through cognitive processes rather than directly" (Bandura, p. 267). For instance, observations through social interactions and personal experiences continue to shape and mold the minds of all people. Whether a person is a victim of colorism or a bystander of its actions, a cognitive development is at work that urges the public to learn the teachings or become desensitized to its harsh reality. Thus, given the external influence, it is important to understand the role that media plays in psychological colonization of colorism.

According to historical concepts, even present-day literature is a strive for publicity under any means necessary (Grunig, 2013). Even if it dispels more truth, than falsehood, it is free publicity that reaches a target audience that otherwise may have been unobtainable. The literature, like so many more of its time, passes on the views and reality of colorism that can perpetuate false ideologies or effectively educate.

William Wells Brown is the pioneer of two great social firsts. His claim to fame is shadowed by his mental foregoing in relation to color hierarchy in the Black community. Brown is the first African-American novelist. Detailing himself as an abolitionist and feminist (modern day womanist), one of his most renowned works titled "Clotel; or the President's Daughter: A Narrative of Slave Life in the United States…," Brown disperses the colorism divide between

the "white-slaves" also known as the mulattos (bi-racial products of a White and Black parent;

(Okazawa-Rey, Robinson, & Ward, 1986).

The heroine of Brown's story, Clotel, is Black, but she is described as having White

features as a Black beauty. Brown may not have been the first to do this but is certainly not the

last. This is a recurring archetypal assist in Black historical literature that has trickled into media

advertisement literature, such as Frances E. W. Harper's *Iola Leroy* and Toni Morrison's *The*

Bluest Eye (Okazawa-Rey, Robinson & Ward, 1986). Colorism, however, is not a Black-White

or dark issue; it is a global issue that has emerged into a dynamical power force dividing people

from people and, in turn, people from self (Baxley, 2014; Jha, 2016). It refers to many

nationalities, ethnicities, and colors across the spectrum.

In Asian culture, *symbolic racism* (Henry & Sears, 2002) is just as prevalent as it is in

American culture, if not more (Li, Min, Belk, Kimura, & Bahl). *Symbolic* refers to "abstract

system of early learned moral values and ideals" (Henry & Sears, 2002, p. 254) and *racism*

refers to the social construct surrounding the terminology of race and was chosen because the

construct was thought in part to reflect racial antipathy (Henry & Sears, 2002). However, this

same terminology can be applied to colorism in the same context, juxtaposing lightness with

darkness. Whiteness is a social construct that celebrates colonialism, imperialism, and western

ideologies. In turn, normal, everyday diction gives praises to these ideals as well. Symbolic

racism perpetuates blackness as something that should be disliked or looked down upon. In

"Skin Lightening and Beauty in Four Asian Countries", scholars state:

> "In Indian culture, 'black' is associated with underprivileged people and is a
>
> symbol of 'dark,' dirty,' 'wrong,' 'hell,' and 'unfairness' and is opposite to
>
> 'good,' 'bright,' and 'well-being'. White skin is always associated with positive

messages in Indian and Hindu culture. It is taken as a sign of 'beauty,' 'purity,'

'cleanliness,' and 'happiness,' and is a symbol of power and privilege" (Li, Min,

& Belk, 2008, p. 445).

Moreover, when it comes to color preference in Japan, White women are seen as

beautiful and Blacks are regarded as horrid and beast-like (Li et al, 2008). Moreover, this

initiation and continuum is intentional. This is what constructs "beauty in many non-white

cultures" (Li, Min, Belk, Kimura, & Bahl, p. 445).

In 1843, Hong Kong was ordered to open their selling port to Western goods after

losing the Opium Wars. Some of the goods that were being accessed included Pears soap. Pears

soap was advertised to be such a profound cleanser that it could make a Black child White.

Again, overt symbolic racism is at work. As a result, women in Asia progressively began to

Westernize themselves by the 1930s, in not just material fashion but physiognomy

appearance—White skin (Li et al. 2008). Using colorism as a beauty standard is a marketing

tool that has been used for a very long time, globally.

Public Relations in Racial Contexts

According to the Public Relations Society of America, also referred to as PRSA, "At its

core, public relations is about influencing, engaging and building a relationship with key

stakeholders across a myriad of platforms in order to shape and frame the public perception of

an organization*" (PRSA, 2018). There are varying definitions of public relations as it relates to

a wide-range of tasks. Aside from the succinct definition provided by that of PRSA. Publicists

also take on the role of being cultural intermediaries that manage dissensus (Curtin & Gaither,

2007). A more global definition is that PR aids in the fostering of mutually beneficial

relationships between that of the organization and its publics (Sheldrake, 2011). With this

definition, PR also include the overseeing of creatively generated content before it is

disseminated to the public (PRSA, 2018). Therefore, when crises occur, as a result of creative

content, it is before and after a public relations occurrence. To call upon the themes of race,

colorism, and PR, one can better understand the intersectionality that inter-connects them. In

Africa as well as other neighboring countries, the act of skin bleaching, used to solely call upon

poor, dark-skinned women, but through public relational tactics and the evolution of media

advertisements, skin bleaching has adopted new, willing audience members—men as well as the

rich class (Lewis et al. 2012).

PR and race have a deep connection dating as far as back to the colonialist era, entering

the racialization of thought. At the time, one of the only ways for European nations to over-

color Asian, African, and South American nations were through PR motives. Colonial conquest

images were "stamped" on material goods, such as whiskey bottles, soap boxes, chocolate bars,

and the like. This racialization of thought "imposed European cultural norms on African

populations, devaluing the richness of the local cultures and practices" (Munshi & Edwards,

2011, p. 352).

With this historical narrative, PR became synonymous with middle class, White elites—

that was the only target audience. Scholars, Munshi and Edwards state:

"In both domestic and international economies, combined with ideological

imperialist discourses about the racialized other to ensure PR became deeply

embedded in the system by which elite groups justified their existence. The

racialized others in this business context were deemed to be of value only to the

extent that they could be customers or some other public that facilitated profit

motives. Governments and commercial organizations used PR to communicate

the value they provided to society; their audiences were those who mattered—

most frequently the White middle class" (Munshi & Edwards, 2011, p. 352).

White was the norm in ways of living and being on an international level because

"non-White immigrants or the Black population in the United States...were too

poor financially and politically to be of any interest to the PR machinery"

(Munshi & Edwards, 2011, p. 352).

 In a contemporary world, not much has changed from the historical narrative. The

capital acquisition is what keeps this narrative on repeat through the generations as race and

racism are still prevalent matters in society on a global scale (Munshi & Edwards, 2011). Most

recently, Dove has been at the epicenter of PR blunders and colorific scandal the past few years.

One of Dove's earlier campaigns, entitled "Real Beauty" was one of their earliest blunders.

Three sociology scholars, Judith Taylor, Josée Johnston, Krista Whitehead, implored upon a

focus group of select women to give their perception of the campaign. The group professed that

most ads for the campaign elicited light-skinned women when it came to women of color. They

did not represent all hair types. Hair that was kinky in texture was not given a stand. Women

who wear head wraps were not given a stand (Taylor, Johnston, & Whitehead, 2016). The

campaign was complicit and did not challenge hegemonic beauty ideals when it came to

women. Instead, they painted a picture of the ideal woman. Hegemonic beauty was the total

representation—that's not diversity.

The color and term of "Black" has a history of closely being associated with

primitiveness, pollution, dirt, and hyper-sexuality. With a historical context of a negative

connotation, the racialization of thought is again perpetuated through images. In 1930, a French

advertising poster was published for a soap called DirtOff. The flyer shows that of an African

man washing his hands, which becomes White after using the product. The caption reads, "Le

Savon Dirtoff me bian chiti." The gag with this historical example is that the soap was not

created for people with a darker hue in skin tone. It was created for the White French—"French

auto mechanics and housewives" (Glenn, 2008, p. 284). The image of showing Black/African

American drastically losing their skin pigmentation as a result of cleansing and bleaching

products has acted as minstrel caricature through the ages. This is one of many advertisements

in the 19th and 20th centuries using Black people as a testimony to report on the validity of

bleaching agents (Glenn, 2008).

Furthermore, using society to breed beauty standards as a selling piece is not a new

tactic as it is dispelled in historical literature. Once more, the public consciously and

unconsciously internalizes the information from selling pieces. In Dove's case, women are the

selling piece. The 1950 Clark Doll Test is a prime example of how the internalization process

latches on to ideologies and warps the cognitive comprehension abilities that become self-

identification tools.

One of the pre-tests administered with the doll test was a line drawing test. This test was

administered to 5, 6, and 7-year-old test subjects. The test was to color in line drawings of an

apple, leaf, orange, mouse, boy, and girl. This test was able to make note of comprehensive

significance between color and object. The children were asked to color the girl (or boy) the

color that they are, and after they complied, they were asked to color the girl (or boy) the color

they preferred girls/boys to look. To measure the responses of the line drawing test, categories

were given to label results: realistic, phantasy, and irrelevant. A realistic response implies that

the child colored the drawing in a color in relation to their own. A phantasy response is one in

which the child colors the character in a vastly different color (e.g., white or yellow). An

irrelevant response is where the child colored the character in a bizarre fashion (e.g., green, purple, blue). Of the 160 children who colored the girl/boy their own color, 141 gave a realistic response to color, 8 gave a phantasy response and 11 gave an irrelevant response. It was observed that phantasy responses decreased with age (Clark & Clark, 1950).

During the Clark Doll Test, 105 Black preschoolers and 50 White preschoolers were taken as test subjects to measure the meaning of color. The children were asked preference questions from two Black researchers to determine which color dolls were most preferred. Administers asked the children, "Give me the doll that... (a) you want to be, (b) you like to play with, (c) is a nice doll, (d) looks bad, (e) is a nice color, (f) you would like to take home if you could?" (Powell-Hopson & Hopson, 1988, p. 59). Results revealed that 65% of Black children chose the White doll to play with and 74% of White children chose the White doll to play with. In total 76% of children chose the Black doll as the doll that "looks bad" (Powell-Hopson & Hopson, 1988). Therefore, children are cognitively aware of color in relation to their own and as age increases, they become even more aware (Clark & Clark, 1950). These two tests also indicate that color preference is a selling piece. This is where the intersection between race, colorism, and PR begins.

The expansion of target markets and infiltration of a permeable culture is what makes international public relations a necessity to make others willing and complicit through rhetorical gentrification. Therefore, a deep methodological approach to analyze international public relations is needed to analyze the Nivea case study.

Theoretical Models for Analyzing Public Relations

In the 1980s, James E. Grunig, introduced four theoretical models to public relations that have been both widely adopted and contested: press agentry model, public information model,

two-way symmetric model, and two-way asymmetric model. The four models of public

relations by Grunig and Hunt are a strategic framework used by the internal sector in the PR

arena to create, strategize, and come up with various tactics to implement (Grunig, 2013). These

models can be used to understand the intersections between colorism and manipulative

dimensions of public relations, such as aiding in a mind push that infiltrates culture.

        One-way model. PR is repeatedly connected using Grunig and Hunt's press agentry and

asymmetric model. The press agentry model is a one-way form of communication. Press

agentry is the public relations theory directly associated with the public production of

propaganda. Press Agentry is a model spawning from theoretical development of the two

scholars. Press agentry theory states that it is a one-way communicative method, that is

presently false. With this information, the press agentry model can assist the public to be aware

of the cultivation of colorism through propaganda. Though it is a two-way form of

communication, it is using high points of manipulation and persuasion to cultivate specific

ideologies that are internalized in the minds of the public audience (Waddington, 2012).

        One of the theory's noted limitations in connection to the PR realm is that it does not

take into account the technologically social world we have become that allows the audience to

not only interact, but communicate in response (Laskin, 2009). Most propaganda are displayed

via the internet, which allows the public to respond making it a two-way model, not one-way.

With this info, now we must consider how two-way models help explain the effects and

influences of colorism in PR campaigns.

        Two-way models. Taking into account the two-way models of Grunig's theories, in

communication there is a sender of a message and a receiver of a message. One-way

communication presumes the audience is not able to communicate back. Two-way

communication assumes the audience is able to communicate back. The two-way asymmetric model encompasses the negative portrayals of the public relations lifestyle. Grunig defines it as "the use of communication to manipulate publics for the benefit of the organizations" (p. 40). The two-way asymmetric model suggests that manipulation is done solely to the public with the masterminds mindful and knowing of the truth. Two-way symmetric model suggests that the "masterminds" as well as the 'puppets" are oblivious to the truth and are both manipulated by the "spinning" that has occurred (Grunig, 2013). The acquired knowledge is not solely for the general public but reduces and has a specific focus on the cultural industry and PR industry. The analysis in this writing is a detailed evaluation of the business process undergone in the PR and marketing world before and after publication of an ad occurs.

Grunig's two-way theoretical model is useful for understanding colorism as cultivating cognitive manipulation. When we look at campaigns, such as Qiaobi, the effects of colorism in PR campaigns paints a message in the receiving audience's mind. When we look at Pears soap, we are living the effects of the mass media advertisement. Pears soap is just one of the exemplar ways in which, media infiltrates and cultivates. As the doll test revealed, if majority of customers prefer white baby dolls and detest dark dolls, why would media advertise anything else? Now this becomes an archetypal trend amongst ads. However, the difference between Pears soap and Qiaobi is that 180s Pears soap was communicated via one-way model with much complicity and 2016 Qiaobi was communicated via a two-way model with much international feedback via social media.

The theoretical framework of Grunig's model is dated, but that's what makes its context ideal for the evolutionary study of public relations. Each model serves as a new age development that contributes to the evolving field. However, each model is applicable and

serves as a governing framework when expressing overt and covert manipulative fashions in advertisement's creative production. They are potentially useful for explaining the reason why a Starbucks was placed in the high-culture, monumental Forbidden City of Beijing. It is the reason why skin bleaching products that were once a product for the poor, captivated the rich. It is the reason why Western culture has become an idol that other countries give praise to.

Colorism through the years has been a cognitive manipulation. Once again, if the public believes the rhetoric that is being sold to them, they become a slave to it. That is precisely what has happened to the concept of colorism. All these points have been and are continually used locally and internationally to achieve the results provided via the four models of public relations. This is one of the limitations of the Grunigan fallacy. One cannot effectively and correctly analyze international PR campaign constructions with a theory that valorizes Western concepts on a local scale and presents a simplistic view of power particularly the one-way influences of a PR organization. Thus, there is a need to reformulate public relations theory that accounts for the complex power dimensions of public relations, particularly as it relates to cultivating colorism.

Articulatory model. Despite the usefulness of Grunig's theory of public relations, researchers have examined articulatory models, particularly the circuit of culture, for understanding the power dimensions at play in public relations (Curtin & Gaither, 2005). As Curtin and Gaithers (2005) argue, the Grunigan fallacy assumes "...that power as a construct can be discounted and beyond the simplistic, deterministic critical assumption that the organization is always in possession of more relative power" (p. 96). Furthermore, as British scholar Raymond Williams, explains, culture does not just define meaning, it constitutes it. It is not just the rules and traditions that make up a community but the inclusiveness of the social practices

that weaves through interrelationships. This is precisely why the circuit of culture, as opposed to Grunig and and Hunt's theory, is has been used as a conceptual framework for understanding and analyzing the influence of public relations.

Meaning is a socially constructed phenomenon. Culture inhibits the social construction putting meaning, language, and culture at the nexus of the construct. Without understanding the interconnections, meaning cannot be determined nor related (Curtin & Gaither, 2007). In public relations, researchers have used the circuit of culture as a good unit of measurement for examining the influence and effects of meaning-making in PR and marketing campaigns. The circuit of culture was created to outline "how and where culture and power intertwine to create meaning" (Curtin & Gaither, 2005, p. 37) and is based upon articulations with PR practitioners as the cultural intermediaries (McNaughton, 2008). The circuit does not determine meaning but uses determinism and relativism to articulate the interconnection between five moments: regulation, representation, identity, production, and consumption (Curtin & Gaither, 2005).

For instance, in Guerrilla communication, visual consumption, and consumer public relations, Melanie McNaugton (2008) calls upon the short circuit of culture (a shortened version of the circuit of culture) to dissect guerilla marketing as a consumer communication convergence. Thus, the circuit of culture is a framework that is commonly called upon for the dissection amongst culture and power and the intermediaries that progress it—PR and marketing (McNaughton, 2008).

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this study is to analyze Nivea's 2017 "Natural Fairness" campaign in order to understand how colorism is consumed through public relations. As a skincare line, Nivea has been ascribing a skin bias brand appeal for various audiences. In America, they

ascribe to a rational brand appeal, but in Africa, they ascribe to an emotional brand appeal

(Nivea, 2018). In America, Nivea is known as a generous skin *care* line that sells hydrating

lotions and creams (Nivea, 2018), whereas in Africa they sell skin lightening lotions and creams

(Nivea, 2018). This study focuses on Nivea's "Natural Fairness" body lotion product that was

advertised in Ghana, promoted skin lightening, and directly correlated lighter skin to

attractiveness (Superjoy, 2017). More specifically, the study applies the circuit of culture model

to public relations (Curtin & Gaither, 2005) in order to fully understand how the campaign was

consumed by digital publics.

A number of studies indicate the significance of studying digital media as sites of

consumption regarding marketing and public relations, especially responses to dominant

ideologies perpetuated through public relations. For instance, on July 13, 2007, Starbucks

withdrew its operations within the Forbidden City after months of critical reception and

consumption via a public blog (Han & Zhang, 2009). At the turn of the century, the Forbidden

City in Beijing opened up a low-culture, fast-food shop—Starbucks. Many locals saw this as not

only distasteful, but disrespectful. The 600-year-old Forbidden City is a monumental museum.

Han and Zhang (2009) state, "For many, the Starbucks inside the Forbidden City is an affront to

the awe-stricken palace" (p. 395). Starbucks is more than $4 coffee: it is a lifestyle. People do

not just go to Starbucks to drink coffee, they go for the lifestyle/brand that accompanies the

coffee. And that lifestyle is Western culture. To take a country that has a history of imperialism

and re-introduce colonialism into one of its historical, most sacred monuments is an act that

infiltrates a permeable culture. What makes the Asian culture permeable is the fact that green

tea is more preferred in the culture, but with the introduction of Starbucks, coffee is now a hot

commodity and civilians are willing to pay more than double for it. However, where Western

culture is not openly accepted, Starbucks is—even in the Forbidden City.

From the lens of that of the consumers and those receiving the narrative from the

Forbidden City storyline, the audience rejected the restaurant. A web-based activist, Rui, who is

also a celebrity blogger, took to a public blog to express negative concern about Starbucks

infiltrating the Forbidden City (Han & Zhang, 2009). Within a year's time, the blog received

"thousands, if not tens of thousands," of supporters via emails and various other online

comments. Rui notes in his blog: "all I want is that Starbucks move out of the Forbidden City

peacefully and quietly. And we'll continue enjoying Starbucks coffee elsewhere in the city"

(Han & Zhang, 2009, p. 396). In addition, because if the overwhelming support of followers

generated from Rui's statements on his blog, other major online forums as well as other

mainstream news and media sites in China and overseas covered the story.

Additionally, a number of studies focus digital activism in relation to Dove's "Real

Beauty" campaign. In "Branding 'Real' Social Change in Dove's Campaign for Real Beauty,"

the digital branding strategy is analyzed in the area of consumption and production in

juxtaposition to feminist ideals in regard to beauty (Murray, 2013). In "Feminist Consumerism

and Fat Activists: A Comparative Study of Grassroots Activism and the Dove Real Beauty

Campaign," researchers analyze the campaign using a digital archival comparison approach

(Johnston & Taylor, 2008).

By using circuit theory of articulation, an in-depth exploratory view of meaning,

language, and culture can be related and determined to understand at all angles of Nivea's

"Natural Fairness" campaign from a global and local perspective. An analysis of the cultural

and racial insensitivities produced by that of Nivea, via a thematic analysis, and internalized by

that of the public can give an intentional understanding of the internal and external publics through a thorough analysis of their "Natural Fairness" campaign by observing the ways in which this influence is consumed. In doing so, the study reveals the subjective role media plays in spreading this influence and how the public in turn internalizes the ideology as a result. The study addresses the impact of color division as a business model used to drive and leverage consumers.

Research Questions

The questions my research is based upon are as follows:

- RQ 1: The media plays a prominent role in how people internalize ideologies. How has the impact of this internalization developed into a business model used to drive consumership?

- RQ 2: In what ways does the business model used in historical and present-day ads have internal and external effects and consequences on the publics?

Chapter 3: Methodology

Theoretical Framework

　　Public relations practitioners create and put into circulation identities designed to create a favorable environment for consumption of campaign messages (Curtin & Gaither, 2007). This study employs the circuit of culture model to analyze the 2016 Nivea campaign, entitled "Natural Fairness," by focusing on the articulatory moment of consumption. By doing an analysis as such, small and big picture analyzation will occur from the external consumption from the public's aspect. Consumption has influence over how information is received. According to Smith, Maguire, and Hu (2013), "Attitudes and habits are shaped by the degree to which consumers identify with traditional cultural values" (p. 672)—which deviate from that of their own through colonialism and westernization (Glenn, 2008). Meaning-making is derived based upon the consumption process, which is a subjective process, "because identities comprise a multitude of socially constructed meanings and practices, such as class, ethnicity, nationality, and gender, they are in flux and fragmented" (Curtin & Gaither, 2007, p. 101). Therefore, consumption is "an ongoing process of agreement upon an interpretation" (Botan & Soto, 1998, p. 22) that is negotiated and contested amongst producers and consumers.

　　Though there are five articulatory moments, focusing on consumption addresses how meaning-making, especially in the case of colorism, is negotiated and contested (Taylor et al., 2002; Curtin & Gaither, 2005). For instance, Han and Zhang (2009) utilized the circuit of culture model to study the consumption of Starbucks campaign in China. Curtain & Gaither (2005) indicate that "what is being consumed is the symbol, not the manufacturing reality" (p. 125). The Western invasion is deeper than a moment that promotes coffee over a culture that prefers tea. It is an affront that places an American, westernized structure inside of a

monumental structure in the heart of China. As the Han & Zhang assert, it is the consuming of an invasive culture.

As scholars have indicated, consumption is useful for understanding the reception of consumption (Lee & Song, 2017). As Lee and Song (2017) state, "audience reception theory contends that the meaning of a text is not inherent in the text itself, but is created within the relationship between the text and the readers" (p. 41). Interpretation and meaning making is dependent on an individual's standpoint that comes from gender, social class, ethnicity, occupation, and overall experience (Lee & Song, 2017). Therefore, as the act of consumption is an ever-changing, transformative process, marketers and publicists alike need to stay abreast on the changes consumers make on products when they give them meaning (Curtin & Gaither, 2009). The public has the power when it comes to meaning-making, accepting, and rejecting. Therefore, audience reception theory is a powerful key in understanding consumption when meaning of text becomes negotiated and not as broadly accepted, as one-way understanding suggests in public relations (Han & Zhang, 2009).

Study Setting: Twitter

In analyzing consumption, this study focuses on reception of the campaign through social media discourse, particularly Twitter. Twitter is a circulatory breeding ground for audiences esteemed opinions concerning brands and overall personal responsive comments on web-circulated ads, as Twitter is an aggressive form of microblogging (Jansen, Zhang, Sobel & Chowdury, 2009). Twitter has also been used as a significant form of two-way communication in public relations, whereby organizations and consumers engage in public discourse (Webb & Robinson, 2017; Schneider, 2016; Altheide, 2015; Rudolph, S. R., 2014). For instance, Einwiller and Steilen (2015) studied the ways Facebook and Twitter function as a resource for

organizations handling complaints by consumers. In "Using Social Media for Support and Feedback by Mental Health Service Users: Thematic Analysis of a Twitter Conversation," Shephard, Sanders, Doyle, and Shaw (2015) reiterated the process using solely Twitter. In addition to these studies, the book chapter "Mentions and Melanin: Exploring the Colorism Discourse and Twitter Culture" by Webb and Robinson (2017) investigated the circulation of colorism in public discourse on Twitter.

Data Collection

This study uses a digital archival method for data collection to analyze how the moment of consumption creates a brand appeal that ascribes to skin bleaching products sold in Africa versus Nivea's hydrating skin creams sold in America. For this study, I analyze the consumption of the Nivea "Visibly Fairer" campaign, particularly responses that indicate acceptance or rejection of the campaign. The data collection process considers collecting the "top" tweets amongst the widely circulated, protesting tag #PullItDownNow. A hashtag, curated by Fuse ODG, a Ghanaian musician. Twitter conversations erupted with the use of the protesting tag. Tweets between the dates of October 2017 to March 2018 will be speculated. Tweets that fall within that timeline are open for scrutiny. Specific hashtags associated with the online protesting of Nivea's Visibly Fairer products are key hashtags used in the unveiling of consumption.

Analysis

This study employs a thematic analysis of Twitter by organizing tweets by descriptive headings and identifying themes that correlate to that of the research questions (Lyles, Lópe, Pasick, & Sarkar 2013; Shephard, Sanders, Doyle, & Shaw, 2015). Generally speaking, a "thematic analysis is a process for encoding qualitative information" (Boyatzis, 1998, p. 4).

Thus, a number of researchers have used thematic analysis to assess communication across a range of discourses. For instance, whereas Lyles et al. (2013) used qualitative content analysis of Twitter to understand health communication knowledge, Shephard et al. (2015) assessed a Twitter conversation regarding support and feedback by mental health service users. Thus, a thematic analysis consists of "initially read[ing] and then re-read[ing] with an identifying code being applied to each tweet" (Shephard et al., 2015, p. 3).

For the purposes of this analysis, pattern coding (Saldana, 2009) is used to study and interpret texts as practices of consumption in the marketplace (Roberts & Pettigrew, 2007; Sayre, 2006). As Boyatzis (1998) further states, employing a thematic analysis is significant during the early and throughout all stages of the research process because it "increases...accuracy or sensitivity in understanding and interpreting observations about people, events, situations, and organizations" (p. 5). The data collection for this study included a two-step process—in-vivo and descriptive coding—were used to read and re-read "the source tweet in order to maintain close allegiance with original meaning." Put another way, the two-step process involved coding patterns by identifying patterns at the "manifest level (directly observable in the information) [and] at the latent level (underlying the phenomenon)" (Boyatzis, 1998 p. 4).

As Saldana (2015) states, a qualitative content analysis consists of "language-based or visual data" (p. 4). In-vivo coding was conducted to discover which words or phrases, taken directly from the published tweets themselves, made a steady appearance in the online campaign. Tweets were extracted from Twitter and imported into an electronic spreadsheet. Tweets were divided into categories based upon two-cycle coding, using the in-vivo process. To limit the subjectivity of coding, in-vivo coding is the most ideal coding process to perform as

the first cycle comes directly from the published tweets and descriptors are built off of the key words/phrases in the second cycle.

The tweet inspection accounted for the personal identifiers and/or geographical indicators. Therefore, any personally identifying materials were removed to ensure the anonymity of publishers. Through the careful sorting of tweets, it allowed removal of tweets that may have been accounted for twice in the process—commonly known as retweets. Tweets were reviewed several times, with codes being applied twice to each tweet as an identifier. The first cycle coding process used exact phrasing from the source tweet in order to maintain close allegiance with original meaning given by that of the publisher. The second cycle allowed tweets to be organized based upon their descriptive headings and themes that were given based upon the first cycle code.

Chapter 4: Results

From the results, 106 original, unduplicated tweets were assessed. In-vivo codes, descriptive codes, and overarching themes are represented alphabetically in Table 1, together with counts of tweets within each theme. The theme *Public Internal and External Effects of PR/Marketing Business Models* contained the greatest amount of material. The theme *Inquire* represents bloggers/journalists reaching out to hashtag participants for direct statements in relation to the campaign. *#PullItDownNow* material refers to published tweets supporting the campaign with solely the protesting text which may or may not accompany a picture or gif of some kind.

Individual themes are thoroughly described below. While the tweets themselves remain discreet, tweet overlap between themes exists.

The Power Difference Between Producers and Consumers

Tweets within this theme addresses the balance/imbalance of power amongst that of the producers and consumers of the advertisements. Curtin and Gaither (2009) discuss the power discrepancy faced in the roles of that the producers and consumer. Through this theme, the same perpetuated narrative is explained via that of the Nivea campaign. Power has been given as a result of social media, as seen with the production of #PullItDownNow. Consumers of the advertisement are exercising their power individually and in unison, taking a stand against rhetorical perpetuation of self-hatred as told by skin bleaching creams—and more precisely, Nivea's "Natural Fairness" campaign:

> *"The #PullItDownNow campaign @niveauk stll on. We wn't rest until d "For*
>
> *visibly fairer skin" billboards are cleared frm d streets of Accra."*

In response to the protesting tweets, Nivea is able to publicly communicate back. In this campaign, Nivea defended their actions in a public response that was given to news sources. Those web sources were captured by Twitter tweets and disseminated back out into the Twittersphere by third party tweeters using the protesting tag:

> *"Nivea Responds To #pullitdownnow Campaign Started By Ghanian Artist, Fuse ODG"*

> And consumers, responded back again in an online global discourse:

> *"#PULLITDOWNNOW this Billboard message is nonsense. WHO TOLD NIVEA BLACK WOMEN ASKED FOR FAIRER SKIN?"*

The audience is asserting its power and is enacting it in real time via social media, specifically Twitter. Power is imbalanced because the audience does not have the same resources as that of the producers, but through their collective voice by means of technology, this campaign has the potential to go in a myriad of directional outcomes with the additional opportunities real-time tweeting provides on a global level through two-way communicative discourse.

Color/Whiteness as a Lucrative Business Model

This theme addresses the binary color opposition that is prevalent in society and how there is a color dominance at play that impacts results. As Curtin and Gaither (2009) say,

> "it is difference which signifies, and it does so by creating binary oppositions: We know what black is because we know it is not white. Within this dichotomized relationship one pole always tends to dominate (e.g., male over female, us over them, high over low; Woodward, 1997b), bringing issues of difference and power to the fore within a representation" (Curtin & Gaither, 2005, p. 99).

This statement supports the notion of power dominance within the dichotomized color representation within a business model.

Tweets coded within this theme reveal if there is a feeling amongst consumers of perpetuated colonialistic ideologies, by the producers, at the subjugation of the Black race. Race/colorism is not just a historical model archetype but reveals itself in contemporary ads - the audience has noted it:

> *"And you thought #colourism doesn't exist? Nivea for the win with this offensive*
>
> *and grossly insensitive ad. #PullItDownNow"*

As we know from an earlier chapter, interpretation and meaning-making is dependent on an individual's standpoint that comes from gender, social class, ethnicity, occupation, and overall experience. This campaign invoked some sense of inner trauma as a result of Nivea's juxtaposition of whiteness and beauty:

> *"It's not enough that some of us had to grow up being likened to charcoal and*
>
> *black cats. You go and do this?? A disgrace!! #PULLITDOWNNOW"*

Nivea's target audience felt victimized as their skin was used as a pawn to rake in extended capital for Nivea/Beiresdorf AG:

> *"@NIVEAUSA this is an intentional colorist media ad campaign because I know*
>
> *for a FACT that you already know. #PullItDownNow"*

Additionally…

> *"#PullItDownNow isn't enough: Nivea's fair skin products are capitalizing on*
>
> *an age-old African insecurity https://qz.com/1113656 @qzafrica"*

Public Internal and External Effects of PR/Marketing Business models

It is to no avail that products, such as Nivea, has far-reaching effects on its consumers (Fultz, 2014; Thompson & Keith, 2001). However, from a PR lens, one can see that these effects are multidimensional and spring from that of the modelized business process. Curtin and Gaither (2005) state, "as a discipline that has far reaching effects on society, public relations need to be understood and examined in a broader social, cultural, and political context rather than in a narrowly defined organization function" (p. 94). Through PR, these effects can be better accessed through the PR lens in its consumption process.

There are various effects that the public faces because of organizations using this colorific business method that the producers capitalize off of. Some of the effects are psychological and physical, while others evoke a sense of self pride and appreciation from the campaign urging people to celebrate their dark skin—contrary to what the Nivea campaign was doing:

"We love our skin and can't sit down for u guys to destroy our bodies

#PULLITDOWNNOW"

The appreciation was plentiful. People turned the negativity of the campaign into something more positive. However, there is a manipulation of the mind at play that can be beneficial or even neglectful:

"Not just power of the people but also power of right thinking and right mind

conditioning. #blackisbeautiful.#PullitDownNow"

These ads do not just evoke psychological trauma but even physical:

"Dear Nivea, too many people are ruining their skin because of ads like this.

COLOURISM is not a myth. #PULLITDOWNNOW"

Table 1

Thematic In Vivo Coding for #PullItDownNow Twitter Analysis

Theme	Descriptive Heading	Count	Total
The power difference between producers and consumers	Power-assertion	9	27
	Defense	7	
	Campaign Disdain	8	
	Hashtag Disdain	1	
	Protest Success	1	
	Global	1	
Colorism/whiteness as a lucrative business model	Racist	4	21
	Color/Whiteness	11	
	Capital	6	
Public internal and external effects of PR/Marketing business models	Proud	20	39
	Appreciation	3	
	Psychological Effects	2	

	Physical Effects	6	

Chapter 5: Discussion

In light of what has been assessed in the analysis, as of 2018, Nivea continues to sell their "Natural Fairness" skin lightening cream with disregard of what has transpired amidst the #PullItDownNow protest (Nivea, 2018). Therefore, in order to continue to bring light and critically address this ongoing perpetuation, we must better understand the three themes as they pertain to "consuming colorism" through Nivea's "Natural Fairness" campaign. The consumption of colorism reveals itself through the dimensions of rejection, identifying and challenging the lucrative ideological business framework of colorism in PR and marketing, as well as demystifying the effect of colorism. Through these dimensions, colorism can be identified and addressed in a global context.

Rejecting Colorism

The understanding of self is a process that is a never reaches completion. Just as the mind and body grows, so does the understanding of self. However, information that is consciously and subconsciously gathered through the consumption of societal ideals impacts the way self is referenced, dealt with, and assessed (Mathews & Johnson, 2015). According to Mathews and Johnson (2015) "one is recurrently forming ideas about the self by internalizing what they have gathered from their audience…the audience is society" (p. 9). Before one begins to internalize, they have the ability to accept or reject the rhetoric that is being sold to them. With the case of colorism, in Nivea's campaign, many people rejected the idea. However, as Mathews and Johnson (2015) eludes to, there is an internal battle played out in the psyche of individuals that must battle the decision to accept or reject a false narrative. As we can see from #PullItDownNow, rejection was not only steep, but the audience utilized their platforms to flex their relative power to reject Nivea's "Natural Fairness" campaign.

They conjured power and unity to not only express but take necessary course of action

to publicly reject Nivea's narrative:

Did Nivea pull down the billboards or do we have to remind them today??? @niveauk

@NIVEAUSA @FeministAfrikan #PULLITDOWNNOW.

The consumption of colorism in the age of social media allows for power to be asserted

by those receiving and/or consuming the narrative. Technology has manifested a power

surgance that allows the audience members to reply in a united, global way.

As shown in the tweets, there is a power difference amongst those of the producers and

the ones protesting the campaign. One tweeter said, "I'm going to dump all my Nivea products

when I get home this evening #PullItDownNow." This tweet not only shows disapproval and

retaliation, but it is public. It is one of many that rallies others together to express and commit

dissent against that of the campaign. Though this campaign was global, it did not measure up to

power possessed by that of the producers. As Curtin and Gaither (2009) state, "the organization

is always in possession of more relative power" (p. 96). The result of that power imbalance

explains why Nivea's "Natural Fairness" creams are still being sold (Nivea, 2018).

Challenging the Lucrativity of Colorism

We now know that the media shapes and forms ideologies through the public relations

and marketing methods that take place. Through the scope of the Nivea campaign we see this

reinforced. In addition, we also see how the producers benefit from using darkness as a

scapegoat in the business industry to push and successfully sell consumer goods. Through the

evolution of PR and marketing, dating back to the 1800s, the goal has been to impose European

cultural norms on high populations of the opposite - such as Africa and China (Munshi &

Edwards, 2011). This imposition has not stopped. It has evolved much like the inception of the

technological era, per the Nivea case study followed by previews of campaigns from Dove and Qiaobi (Dove, 2017; The Drum, 2016).

Pears soap is another constituent that feeds into the lucrative business model of color hierarchy (Li et al., 2008). Case studies in this paper have been traced back to as far as the 1700s and in juxtaposition to present-day ads, the advertisements are just as ridiculing. Advertisements went from propagating Black skin as a minstrel show on White targeted products to perpetuating the same colorific scandal on products marketed to those with dark skin (e.g., skin bleaching creams).

Social media is disrupting this model presently. Global attention has been called to this model through the Nivea campaign. For instance, as one tweet indicated, "#PullItDownNow isn't enough: Nivea's fair skin products are capitalizing on an age-old African insecurity https://qz.com/1113656 @qzafrica." The public are unveiling the sham of colorism through this profitable marketing/public relations business tactics. Just as Paramaswaran and Cardoza (2009) say in their article, "The aggressive pursuit of ethnic marketing also turned into profitable terrain for the launching of new products in the domestic fairness cosmetics industry" (p. 250).

Demystifying the Effects of Colorism

This lucrative model enacts psychological and physical trauma on that of receptive members. One tweet from the analysis said, "it's not enough that some of us had to grow up being likened to charcoal and black cats. You go and do this?? A disgrace!! #PULLITDOWNNOW." The public suffers internally and externally from a lucrative business model that teaches and in turn perpetuates self-hate. The analysis reveals findings of this through the campaign. One tweet from the campaign explicitly said, "@FuseODG the entertainment industry is permeating self-hatred of the black skin. #PULLITDOWNNOW."

Another tweet detailed the physical effects skin bleaching creams has on skin. "Dear Nivea, too many people are ruining their skin because of ads like this. COLOURISM is not a myth. #PULLITDOWNNOW."

Though there are negative effects associated with that of skin bleaching, it is done because of the societal status one wants to achieve—to attract a romantic partner, to gain exemption societal grievances, or to move up the corporate ladder—the pros are endless (Charles & McLean, 2017).

Articulating Colorism

By solely using consumption in this analysis, the results that were wanted/needed were acquired. However, by using all five moments, one would be able to gain a 360-degree view of the campaign from all hands that played a part through multiple lenses. As discussed, the circuit of culture is made up of five articulatory moments: production, consumption, representation, regulation, and identity. Though each intermediary moment of the circuit of culture is independent and unreliant on another, it would make the process of analyzation more thorough.

All information is not readily available at the hands from someone outside of the organization, depending on the campaign being researched, but we know that regardless of producer's intentions, the lens through which we have lived enacts meaning-making on campaigns as such (Lee & Song, 2017). In the following sections, I demonstrate how analyzing a campaign through the lens of each articulatory moment can produce a 360-degree exploratory view of the campaign's influence through its meaning-making process.

Production. Production is the first articulatory moment, which refers to understanding not only how the object is "produced technically, but how the object is produced culturally; how

it is made meaningful—what we term 'encoded' with particular meanings - during the production process" (Du Gay et al., 2013, p. 4). In the case of the "Natural Fairness" campaign this moment is particularly significant given that "...the process of production is often gendered and racialized, and this concept has led to a robust stream of theoretical research that has done much to inform this aspect of practice" (Curtin & Gaither (2009), p. 11). For instance, Han and Zhang utilized the circuit of culture model to study the production of the Forbidden City campaign, when a Starbucks was placed within the monumental Forbidden City in China. The authors indicate that through production, this American-based coffee brand with an adaptive lifestyle was re-branded for Asian tastes and adapted to a culture that culturally prefers tea over coffee (Han & Zhang, 2009). It took the target's culture and produced products that acquiesced to their everyday societal meaning.

In analyzing production, this one would focus on Beiersdorf AG, the German company who owns Nivea, and the ones responsible for the multiple PR blunders as a result of ill mass media advertisement. By studying Beiresdorf AG, one can understand the intentional implementations that were executed by the hands of Beiresdorf AG at a global and local nexus. Data collection for production includes archival research on institutional documents by Beiersdorf AG about the campaign that are publicly available on the Internet. Additionally, data can be collected from industry documents in the marketing field, especially consumer reports, press releases, etc.

Representation. As Curtain and Gaither (2009), "Representation is the discursive process by which cultural meaning is generated and given shape: 'we give things meaning by how we represent them'" (p. 99). As they continue, representation is not a static formation but a social construction based upon symbols, discourse, language, and other nuances that share a

cultural space with the output of the message that inherently belong to no one—neither sender

not receiver. In the Forbidden City campaign, Starbucks represents that of an upper-class,

westernized lifestyle. Juxtaposing that with the heavy philosophical interior of the Forbidden

City, it is revealed that Starbucks has no place in the Forbidden City (Han & Zhang, 2009).

In "Public Relations and Sport in Promotional Culture" by Jacquie L'Etang (2015), they

discuss how representation in the sports arena is very limited in terms of gender, religion, age,

ideology—the list is infinite. Just as the Forbidden City and sports promotions were analyzed,

Nivea's promotional representation was analyzed in aspects of its visual representation within

videos, and text that have circulated Twitter and YouTube in conjunction with their products

sold in Africa juxtaposed to that of their products sold in America.

Consumption. Consumption is the third articulatory moment for investigating the

campaign. For instance, Han and Zhang (2009) utilized the circuit of culture model to study the

consumption of Starbucks campaign in China. The authors indicate that "what is being

consumed is the symbol, not the manufacturing reality" (p. 398). The Western invasion is

deeper than a moment that promotes coffee to a culture that prefers tea. It is an affront that

places an American, westernized structure inside of a monumental structure in the heart of

China. It is the consuming of an invasive culture. In analyzing consumption, as done in this

study, focus was paid attention to the reception of the campaign through social media discourse,

particularly Twitter and YouTube.

Identity. The moments of production and consumption are what shape identity.

However, identity is mostly signified as the anomaly, the difference makes, "what it is not"

(Curtin & Gaither, 2005). We know that Starbucks is a brand itself that does not acquiesce to

the typical coffee brands. How does the identity of the brand complement that of the culture?

This is why Starbucks failed by infiltrating the walls of the Forbidden City. By detailing

meaning through the identification of Beiresdorf AG as a whole and then viewing the

identification of its sister product, Nivea, one can then analyze the culture of Africa and

America to better understand why the various types of emotional branding are more tolerated in

Africa and less tolerated in America.

Regulation. Regulation is where "power" enters the equation. This articulatory moment

means to "regulate and organize conduct and practices—they help to set the rules, norms and

conventions by which social life is ordered and governed" (Hall, 1997, p. 4). It provides the

assessment of limitations by that of the producers internally (Thompson & Keith, 2001) as well

as the ethical organizational structure of the company. This would include policies and

procedures as well as what is considered right, wrong, acceptable, and unacceptable (Han &

Zhang, 2009).

Therefore, just as it can empower, it can disempower. This is where public relations

place a significant role in which using technology that is constantly evolving and playing a

prominent role where the audience is given a responsive voice. The voice can be complicit or

even activist-like in protest. Before the Forbidden City escalated into a cultural crisis, it was a

heated discussion gradually taking over social media and blogging sites. This is where public

relations enter the equation to dismantle crises (Han & Zhang, 2009).

Chapter 6: Implications

Given that colorism has a big impact in PR, studies show it can also be rejected as well as accepted (Han & Zhang, 2009; Taylor, Demont- Heinrich, Broadfoot, & Jian, 2002; Scherer, 2007). This phenomenon not only goes against one of PR's historic theories, but scholars are in agreement that Grunig and Hunt's four models of public relations are no longer a flawless model, as they do not take into account the digital world we have succumbed to (Leitch & Neilson, 2001; Stauber & Rampton, 1995). As Leitch and Neilson (2001) state,

"...it is time to move on from the four, or more, models of public relations to develop a more comprehensive theory that goes beyond the typology represented by the four models. Typologies are a useful way to begin the development of a theory, but for science and scholarship to progress we need to move beyond typologies to conceptualize and to measure the theoretical dimensions that underline a typology" (p. 348).

In the case of race, scholars must address public relations as a critical function itself; there are guidelines needed when it comes to protecting the client (company) and the audience (consumers; L'Etang,McKie, Snow, & Xifra, 2015). Further research can dissect this dichotomy by further exploring and regarding public relations and race as critical functions.

Thus, this study has utility for expanding upon recent studies of critical public relations, especially those that focus on race in relation to management function and debunking function. Critical public relations can be defined as "the ways in which the public relations strategies of powerful global actors influence global and local policies, and the lives of locally situated publics" (Pal & Dutta, 2008, p. 164). Critical public relations is a critique of the field. Grunig (2001) states, "in a professional field such as public relations, I believe scholars must go beyond

criticizing theories; they also have the obligation to replace theories with something better—an obligation that many critical scholars do not fulfil" (p. 17). By investigating public relations with a critical approach, the field can emerge by addressing the power dynamics by way of the publics and internal sectors. This investigation addresses it on a global and local perspective through a critical lens that can modify the field for the better by challenging the structures of power and domination.

This critical approach is applied to a variety of additional studies, such as "Emerging International Standards for Measurement and Evaluation of Public Relations: A Critical Analysis" by Jim McNamara (2014) and others. Thus, scholars in the field are privy to the application of critical public relations as a praxis. In "Power Over, Power with, and Power to Relations: Critical Reflections on Public Relations, the Dominant Coalition, and Activism," Berger (2005) discusses that in order to serve society, the activist role in public relations may need to be taken up. Moreover, Coombs and Holiday (2012) highlight the ways in which activism leads to critical public relations.

However, whereas some researchers have indicated that "public relations scholars must consider unintended consequences of public relations practices at the societal and individual levels" (Dozier & Lauzenp, 2000, p. 3), other studies indicate that critical public relations have utility for the activist role by public relations practitioners and the general public. For example, in "White Leader Prototype," Logan (2011) discusses the racial imbalance at leadership levels by dissecting the field of public relations through a critical lens. In "Is Using Social Media 'Good' for the Public Relations Profession? A Critical Reflection," Valentini (2015) discusses how the rhetorical and relational sides of PR needs to be reconciled through a critical critique

(Valentini, 2015). Here the activism role is critically addressed in PR articles, as it opens up an additional lens to better modify the field.

When it comes to the pedagogical or even andragogical context of educating, counter-campaigns by the public have been created to reflect activism in an educational way. For example, there are public syllabi that have been produced with Solange's "A Seat at the Table" and Beyonce's "Lemonade" as the inspirational sage to ignite themed, thorough race conversations in the classroom, or even in the homes of those who wish to learn more. In an everyday sense, the relational outcomes between nonprofit and corporate PR can be assessed in a similar way using the praxis as explained in this study. PR is the tool that can be used to reshape and redefine. Health and beauty is just one of the ways in which this praxis can be explained, however, there are many more through the production of syllabi and other digital methods that play major factors in the public accepting or rejecting the idea.

Chapter 7: Conclusion and Future Research

The impacts of colorism are wide-range. Colorism not only spreads racial ideologies but causes undue stress and self-efficacy problems—particularly in men and women of color. In order to combat it in future research, it first needs to be addressed in the present-day form in which it is perpetuated and received by the mass—social media, and most noticeably, Twitter. This critical reception is a concern for vital impact.

The analysis performed received much discussion within the theme *Public Internal and External Effects of PR/Marketing Business Models.* With a focus on the psychological effects of colorism, not only are there disadvantages society places on individual's dependent on their skin color, but there is grief stricken within that of the individual being publicly shamed. That grief carries loads of internal and external damage knowingly and unknowingly enacted on that of the individual. Skin color is a component in and of itself that supersedes gender and even age (Thompson & Keith, 2001). Scholars Thompson and Keith (2001) agree as "The use of self-reported skin tone may possibly contaminate the observed relationship between skin tone and self-concept outcomes". Again, the Black body is more than generations of physical abuse, it is mental as well. This physical and social cognitive process used is known as colorism.

The concept of colorism that has mind-tapped the minds of the public and potentially even the masterminds has consequently caused a chain reaction that effects the Black sexes. As scholars Okaxawa-Rey, Robinson, and Ward (1986) state, "A woman's self-concept develops in part from observing and internalizing what others think about her" (p. 4). The social cognitive theory makes another appearance in this reality. Without any idea of self-concept or self-identification, colorism stereotypes that is cultivated through people and media takes a home in

the mind. Whatever those stereotypes may be for an African American of lighter or darker hue, it is embodied and acted out consciously or subconsciously.

Skin lightening creams perpetuate this ideology of having a warped view of self. The only way to dismantle this nationwide phenomenon is through education—Education of self. Education of kin. Education of self-love. And that is the path future research must take.

Persons of color, for this matter, must GET OUT of their mental distrust, mental humiliation, mental slug, and feed their mental rich culture. With knowledge of self comes a deeper love and appreciation that goes past race and skin color. It touches the core of the person. Without race, ethnicity, color, and gender, "Who are you?" That is the imperative question that must be asked. That is what will combat colorism and enact color acceptance nationwide.

From a scholarly, research perspective, the next steps in this process would be to closely look at African American men and women of our present-day. To analyze the channels that perpetuate such a hateful teaching and see how it negatively affects the minds of women and men. With the mental examination underway, then we can see how the superior or inferior traits are taught and acted out in the minds of African American men and women. In another direction, rich African culture can be assessed. The knowledge of how stripping away someone's culture, with which they identify with, can greatly influence mental and even physical instability can lead to ascribing and accepting the labels placed on the backs of Black folks by Euro and androcentric-dominated ideologies. Research could also go in the direction of scattering the truths of "New America" and how in years to come, everyone will desire the appearance of not White, but "café con crema." In the same research, it can also be taught how everyone in this new world will be majority African American by greater DNA percentage (Harris, 1999).

I hope that this study informs people more about Black culture, and although there is not just one Black experience, there is a shared history with present-day tribulations all are subjected to. I hope it brings a greater yearn and in turn active assistance to learn more about culture and self. Knowledge it not power, but truthful knowledge can elevate a person beyond what stairs can carry. I hope to spread that truth through these writings and more to come.

References

Altheide, H. (2015). *A thematic insight to a dialogic approach of NBA organizations Twitter content*. The University of Texas at Arlington.

Baxley, T. (2014). Taking off the rose-colored glasses: Exposing colorism through counter narratives. *Taboo, 14*(1), 20.

Berger, B. K. (2005). Power over, power with, and power to relations: Critical reflections on public relations, the dominant coalition, and activism. *Journal of Public Relations Research, 17*(1), 5-28. Doi:10.1207/s1532754xjprr1701_3.

Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). *Thematic analysis: Coding as a process for transforming qualitative information*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Burke, M., & Embrich, D. G. (2008). Colorism. International encyclopedia of the social sciences, 2, 17-18.

Charles, C. A. D., & McLean, S. (2017). Body image disturbance and skin bleaching. *British Journal of Psychology, 108*(4), 783-796. 10.1111/bjop.12241

Clark, K., & Clark, M. (1950). Emotional factors in racial identification and preference in negro children. *The Journal of Negro Education, 19*(3), 341-350. doi:10.2307/2966491

Curtin, P. A., & Gaither, T. K. (2007). *International public relations: Negotiating culture, identity, and power*. California. Sage.

Curtin, P. A., & Gaither, T. K. (2005). Privileging identity, difference, and power: The circuit of culture as a basis for public relations theory. *Journal of Public Relations Research, 17*(2), 91-115. Doi:10.1207/s1532754xjprr1702_3

Dozier, D. M., & Lauzen, M. M. (2000). Liberating the intellectual domain from the practice:

Public relations, activism, and the role of the scholar. *Journal of Public Relations*

Research, *12(*1), 3-22.

Du Gay, P., Hall, S., Janes, L., Madsen, A. K., Mackay, H., & Negus, K. (2013). *Doing cultural*

studies: The story of the Sony Walkman. California. Sage.

Finkelman, P. (2013). The Origins of Colorism in Early American Law. Color Matters: Skin

Tone Bias and the Myth of a Postracial America, 29.

Fultz, L. A. (2014). *The psycho-social impact of colorism among African American women:*

Crossing the Divide(Doctoral dissertation, Wright State University).

Gabrielle, C. (2008). Colourism: From a Local Legacy of Slavery to a Global Power Dynamics.

Journal de BabeLg (Le), *25*.

Glenn, E. N. (2008). Yearning for lightness: Transnational circuits in the marketing and

consumption of skin lighteners. *Gender and Society, 22*(3), 281-302.

10.1177/0891243208316089

Grunig, J. E. (2013). Excellence in public relations and communication management.

Routledge.

Hall. (1973). Encoding/decoding. Retrieved from

https://www.kcesmjcollege.in/ICT/English/Encoding%20Decoding%20final%20notes.p

df

Han, G. & Zhang, A. (2009). Starbucks is forbidden in the forbidden city: Blog, circuit of

culture and informal public relations campaign in china. *Public Relations Review, 35*(4),

395-401. doi:10.1016/j.pubrev.2009.07.004

Harris, V. (1999). "They should have destroyed more": The destruction of public records by the
South African state in the final years of apartheid, 1990-1994. National Archives of
South Africa.

Henry, P. J., & Sears, D. O. (2002). The symbolic racism 2000 scale. *Political Psychology,
23*(2), 253-283. Doi:10.1111/0162-895X.00281

Hochschild, J. L., & Weaver, V. (2007). The skin color paradox and the American racial order.
Social Forces, *86*(2), 643-670.

Hunter, M. (2007). The persistent problem of colorism: Skin tone, status, and inequality.
Sociology Compass, *1*(1), 237-254.

Jansen, B. J., Zhang, M., Sobel, K., & Chowdury, A. (2009). Twitter power: Tweets as
electronic word of mouth. *Journal of the Association for Information Science and
Technology, 60*(11), 2169-2188.

Jha, M. R. (2016). *The global beauty industry: Colorism, racism, and the national body*.
London: Routledge.

Johnson, G. S., & Mathews, T. J. (2015). Skin complexion in the twenty-first century: The
impact of colorism on african american women. *Race, Gender & Class, 22*(1-2), 248-
274.

Johnston, J., & Taylor, J. (2008). Feminist consumerism and fat activists: A comparative study
of grassroots activism and the dove real beauty campaign. *Signs, 33*(4), 941-966.
Doi:10.1086/528849

Laskin, A. V. (2009). The evolution of models of public relations: An outsider's perspective.
Journal of Communication Management, *13*(1), 37-54.

Lee, T. K., & Song, G. (2017). Masculinity and aspiring consumption: A reception study of

    men's lifestyle magazines in contemporary china. *East Asian Journal of Popular*

    Culture, 3(1), 39-58. Doi:10.1386/eapc.3.1.39_1

Leitch, S., & Neilson, D. (2001). Bringing publics into public relations: New theoretical

    frameworks for practice. Heath, Robert. *Handbook of public relations*, (pp. 127-138).

    Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

L'Etang, J., McKie, D., Snow, N., & Xifra, J. (Eds.). (2015). *The Routledge handbook of critical*

    public relations. Routledge.

Li, Min, Belk, Kimura, & Bahl (2008). Skin Lightening and Beauty in Four Asian Cultures. in

    NA - *Advances in Consumer Research* 35, 444-449. Retrieved from

    http://acrwebsite.org/volumes/13415/volumes/v35/NA-35.

Logan, N. (2011). The white leader prototype: A critical analysis of race in public relations.

    Journal of Public Relations Research, 23(4), 442-457. 10.1080/1062726X.2011.605974.

Macnamara, J. (2014). Emerging international standards for measurement and evaluation of

    public relations: A critical analysis. *Public Relations Inquiry, 3*(1), 7-29.

    Doi:10.1177/2046147X14521199

Norwood, K. J. (Ed.). (2013). *Color matters: Skin tone bias and the myth of a postracial*

    America. Routledge.

Munshi, D., & Edwards, L. (2011). Understanding 'race' In/And public relations: Where do we

    start and where should we go? *Journal of Public Relations Research, 23*(4), 349-367.

    Doi:10.1080/1062726X.2011.605976

Murray, D. P. (2013). Branding 'real' social change in dove's campaign for real beauty. *Feminist Media Studies, 13*(1), 83-101. 10.1080/14680777.2011.647963

Nivea. *Beiresdorf.* Retrieved from https://www.nivea.com.gh/

Nivea. (2018). Retrieved from https://www.niveausa.com/

Pal, M., & Dutta, M. J. (2008). Public relations in a global context: The relevance of critical modernism as a theoretical lens. *Journal of Public Relations Research, 20*(2), 159-179. Doi:10.1080/10627260801894280

Parameswaran, R., & Cardoza, K. (2009). Melanin on the margins: Advertising and the cultural politics of Fair/Light/White beauty in india. *Journalism & Mass Communication Monographs, 11*(3), 213-274. 10.1177/152263790901100302

Phinney, J. S., Cantu, C. L., & Kurtz, D. A. (1997). Ethnic and american identity as predictors of self-esteem among african american, latino and white adolescents. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 26*(2), 165-185. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.emich.edu/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/204518183?accountid=10650

Powell-Hopson, D., & Hopson, D. S. (1988). Implications of doll color preferences among black preschool children and white preschool children. *Journal of Black Psychology, 14*(2), 57-63. doi:10.1177/00957984880142004

Roberts, M., & Pettigrew, S. (2007). A thematic content analysis of children's food advertising. *International Journal of Advertising*, *26*(3), 357-367.

Rudolph, S. R. (2014). *Crisis at the finish line: A thematic analysis of instructing information via Twitter* (Doctoral dissertation, North Dakota State University).

Saldana, J. (2009). The coding manual for researchers. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage. Scott, CR, &

    Timmerman, CE (1999). New communication technology use and multiple workplace

    identifications among organizational teleworkers with varied degrees of virtuality. IEEE

    Transactions on Communications, 42, 240-259.

Saldaña, J. (2015). The coding manual for qualitative researchers. Sage.

Sayre, S. (2006). *Qualitative methods for marketplace research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Scherer, J. (2007). Globalization, promotional culture and the production/consumption of online

    games: engaging Adidas's Beat Rugby' Campaign. *New Media & Society*, *9*(3), 475-496.

Schneider, Christopher J. (2016) Police presentational strategies on Twitter in Canada. *Policing

    and Society, (26)*2, 129-147, Doi:10.1080/10439463.2014.922085

Sheldrake, P. (2011). The business of influence: Reframing Marketing and PR for the Digital

    Age. John Wiley & Sons.

Smith Maguire, J., & Hu, D. (2013). Not a simple coffee shop: Local, global and glocal

    dimensions of the consumption of starbucks in china. *Social Identities, 19*(5), 670-684.

    10.1080/13504630.2013.835509

Stauber, J. C., & Rampton, S. (1995). *Toxic sludge is good for you*. Common Courage Press.

Superjoy. (2017). NIVEA Natural Fairness Body Lotion-TVC. [video file]. *YouTube*. Retrieved

    from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hkqok_3hYo4

Taylor, B. C., Demont-Heinrich, C., Broadfoot, K. J., Dodge, J., & Jian, C. (2002). New media

    and the circuit of cyber-culture: Conceptualizing Napster. *Journal of Broadcasting &

    Electronic Media*, *46*(4), 607-629.

Taylor, J., Johnston, J., & Whitehead, K. (2016). A corporation in feminist clothing? Young women discuss the dove 'Real beauty' campaign. *Critical Sociology, 42*(1), 123-144. doi:10.1177/0896920513501355.

Laowhy86. (2016). Is This The Most Racist Advertisement Ever? (From China): Qiaobi (俏比). [video file]. *YouTube*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tRM_9aNw8O8

Thompson, M. S., & Keith, V. M. (2001). The blacker the berry: Gender, skin tone, self-esteem, and self-efficacy. *Gender & Society*, *15*(3), 336-357.

Valentini, Chiara. (2015). Is using social media "good" for the public relations profession? A critical reflection. *Public Relations Review*, *41*(2), 170.

Waddington, Stephen (2012). A critical review of the Four Models of Public Relations and the Excellence Theory in an era of digital communication. Retrieved from http://wadds.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2013/06/chartered-practitioner-paper-FINAL.pdf

Webb, S. L., & Robinson, P. A. (2017). Mentions and Melanin. In *Color struck* (pp. 19-35). SensePublishers, Rotterdam.

Wilder, J. (2015). *Color Stories: Black Women and Colorism in the 21st Century: Black Women and Colorism in the 21st Century*. ABC-CLIO.