2013

Is There Trauma and Resilience in Adolescents Who Experienced Immigration Raids? An Annotated Bibliography of Research

Esther Ayers
Eastern Michigan University, eayers@emich.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://commons.emich.edu/honors

Part of the Social Work Commons

Recommended Citation
http://commons.emich.edu/honors/329

This Open Access Senior Honors Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Honors College at DigitalCommons@EMU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Senior Honors Theses by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@EMU. For more information, please contact lib-ir@emich.edu.
Is There Trauma and Resilience in Adolescents Who Experienced Immigration Raids? An Annotated Bibliography of Research

**Degree Type**
Open Access Senior Honors Thesis

**Department**
Social Work

**First Advisor**
Yvette Colon, PhD

**Second Advisor**
Betty Brown-Chappell, PhD

**Keywords**
immigration raids, undocumented, immigration policy, affect, families

**Subject Categories**
Social Work
IS THERE TRAUMA AND RESILIENCE IN ADOLESCENTS WHO EXPERIENCED IMMIGRATION RAIDS? AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF RESEARCH

By

ESTHER AYERS

A Project Submitted to

Eastern Michigan University

Honors College

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for Graduation

With Honors in Social Work

Approved at Ypsilanti, Michigan, on April 1, 2013
Acknowledgement

The author of this project would like to thank the supervising instructor, Dr. Yvette Colón for her countless hours, commitment and dedication as a facilitator for this project. The author of this project would also like to give a special thank you to the honors advisor at the School of Social Work, Dr. Betty Brown-Chappell, for reviewing this project and for providing recommendations.

Introduction

Immigration raids have been on the rise since 2003 when the Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) agency was created to coordinate interior immigration enforcement efforts (Wessler, 2011). These events separated families. Undocumented family members were arrested and taken away in handcuffs with no further information about their location or status (Capps, Castañeda, Chaudry, & Santos, 2007). The psychological and practical effects on children can be significant (Juby & Kaplan, 2011). These effects include fear, apprehension, distrust, depression, anxiety and financial instability. This annotated bibliography analyzed nationwide research conducted over the past ten years as immigration raids have increased significantly.

Immigration policy is enforced along the border by the Border Patrol which is a division of the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) U.S. Customs and Border Protection. This organization regulates migration at ports of entry, and prevents undocumented workers along the United States border. ICE has some overlap with the Border Patrol, but primarily coordinates interior activities and utilizes three programs leveraging local law enforcement. The 287(g) program established agreements with local law enforcement, provided training, and authorized
agencies to act as ICE agents. The Criminal Alien Program (CAP) works with federal, state, and local correction institutions to detain and deport criminal noncitizens. Secure Communities was initiated in 2008 and automatically sends information to ICE whenever local police departments run a standard background check. In the fiscal year 2011, the United States deported a record-breaking 397,000 people and of those detained 22% were parents of U.S. citizen children. As more noncitizens are detained, the number of children in foster care with parents removed by ICE is expected to grow (Wessler, 2011).

The field of research on the psychological effects on children impacted by raids is greatly limited. The majority of the research has focused on the impact of immigration raids on the adults and the observable changes in the children’s behavior (Chaudry, Capps, Pedroza, Castañeda, Santos & Scott, 2010). These behavior changes included loss of appetite, crying spells, becoming withdrawn, and insomnia.

Furthermore, some research has attempted to determine the impact of immigration raids on children’s school performance. It was reported that some students were withdrawn, some were more likely to not attend school and some experienced difficulty concentrating; hence, these issues significantly lower their academic performance. Professionals working with this targeted population have observed disruption in education, symptoms of separation anxiety and attachment disorder in children (Capps, et al, 2007). Common psychological factors experienced from witnessing immigration raids included untreated substance abuse, sleep disorders, and Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). All of the above affected both children and adults.

Thirteen articles were selected for this annotated bibliography based on their relevance to the psychological impact on children and their families, relevance to the current policy implementation, and analysis of both trends and individual cases. Articles that recommended
tools and strategies were also included to present a current understanding of methods to assist children and families. The research gathered is primarily focused on immigrants from Mexico and Central America. Research on this topic is not restricted to this population; however, the limited research conducted is focused on Latinos due to their high risk to be affected by deportation raids.

Annotated Bibliography


The Human Rights article is a literature review which provided suggestions on how social workers can advocate policies to keep families together and preserve the quality of life for all children growing up in the United States. Furthermore it found that children impacted by immigration raids experienced emotional trauma, distrust, financial instability and a lower sense of well-being.

When effectively working with families who have been impacted by raids the article stressed the importance of abiding by the NASW Code of Ethics 6.04 (a) Social and Political Action which suggests social workers advocate for social justice and 6.04 2 (d) which advises social workers to fight against discrimination.

The report provided actions that can be taken to educate social workers. These actions included: continued education on the topic of immigration and working with trusted community agencies that had experience working with the immigrant population. It will be useful in the future for social workers to gain cultural competency when working with clients who have
experienced psychological effects from immigration raids. The report stresses the importance of creating awareness in the community and keeping updated on current legislation surrounding the topic of immigration.


The exploratory and preliminary report was a collaborative effort between the Urban Institute and the National Council of La Raza (NCLR) to better understand how many children may be at risk of being affected by worksite raids. Semi-structured interview guides were used to collect standardized information from participants in cities with large Latino populations; these guides also allowed for open-ended discussions with respondents. Data on the number of children directly affected were collected, when possible, from each site. National figures on children of undocumented immigrants and their characteristics were obtained using data from the March 2005 U.S. Current Population Survey (CPS), enhanced by Urban Institute assignments of legal status to noncitizens in the survey.

The research focused on children because they are emotionally, financially and developmentally dependent on their parents' care. It stated that children are just as vulnerable to immigration enforcement as their parents. The arrest, detention, and possible deportation of one or more parents have potentially great immediate and longer-term impact on these children. The most important factor for children's safety and well-being is how the raids are conducted. It is imperative that decisions made by the officers conducting the raids are sensitive to parents'
responsibilities and children’s needs. Although the researchers were not in the field long enough
to observe the behavior of the children in school, there was evidence that stress related to raids
may have negatively affected the children’s academic performance. There was a reported
decline in attendance at school. Some children had a difficult time concentrating at school,
which eventually reflected negatively in their grades. The study identified psychological distress
in children affected by raids. Separation of families caused emotional trauma in some children.
The trauma of separation was greater when it continued for an extended period of time, which
eventually threatened their sense of security. The researchers identified a pervasive sense of
insecurity in children affected by immigration raids and also found that this insecurity produced
anxiety in children. Some common conditions ranged from separation anxiety to attachment
disorder and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder. Sudden separation triggered emotions of
abandonment, sadness, anger and aggression.

In addition, the research found that Latino immigrants generally seemed to be reluctant to
seek mental health care for a variety of reasons including access, language barrier and stigma.
This meant children and parents' mental health needs following the raids were seldom addressed.
The research gives recommendations for policy changes, planning and organizing to relieve the
impact of future raids on children and communities. The worksite raids inevitably affected large
numbers of children. This may have an adverse consequence on the entire family. Millions of
U.S. children continue to be at substantial risk of separation from their parents, economic
hardship, and psychological trauma until federal policy-makers recognize the impact
immigration policies have on children and change those policies accordingly. Recommendations
were made at the end of the report for Congress, ICE, public schools, State and Local
government and nonprofit service providers to have a plan along with allocated resources and funds for families affected by immigration raids.

This research gave evidence of the physiological trauma that is acquired after an immigration raid. Some of the emotions described by observations of health professionals were separation anxiety, Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder and attachment disorder. In addition, it described some challenges immigrant families may face, including overcoming stigma of reaching out for mental health services, along with gaining accessibility and trusting agencies to build an alliance with immigrant families. The implications for the social work profession are immense. There is a requirement to overcome the barriers that inhibit Latinos from seeking assistance for mental health issues. This will require community outreach to build trust and understanding with the broader community. It will require access to bilingual trained community based professionals. The need for social workers to address the needs of children affected by raids requires training and planning long before the raids are executed in the community.


This policy brief article is a literature review that analyzed the intersection of the child welfare system with immigration enforcement. It highlighted the challenges undocumented families face in the midst of deportation. Recommendations were provided to pursue solutions that maintain family integrity and to ensure parents received due process if families are separated. It also reported the physiological and economical trauma that children endure when immigration raids occur. The Urban Institute identified short term and long term effects of raids
such as; safety, economic security, and overall well-being. In addition, the article found that language and cultural barriers, limited access to services, and the difficulty of navigating both the immigration and child welfare systems threaten immigrant parents' ability to meet case plan requirements and timelines. In closing, it suggested the policies and practices should be developed to preserve family unity and prevent the unnecessary involvement of children in the child welfare system during all immigration enforcement.

This article gave evidence of the many challenges, which included language barriers and service access families endured during deportation inhibiting meeting the requirements from immigration and child welfare systems.


This report is a non random sample that is not inferential. There were a total of 190 participants for the survey and 87 responded to the surveys. This gave a representing 83 households. It looked at the fears of children who have parents that are unauthorized. It suggested the fears are different than those of other children in the United States, because their parents can be arrested and removed at any time. The report documented impacts immigration raids had on children. The semi-structured protocols focused on four sets of questions. The first set of questions looked at the separation of parents and children following immigration enforcement. The second looked at the effects of immigration enforcement on family well-being. The third looked at the consequences for children, for example changes in child
behaviors. The fourth looked at community responses to raids and gave recommendations. The sampling methodology involved subjective sampling of sites and respondents within sites. The study aimed to interview a diverse group of families to capture the range of experiences that they and their children encountered. It was a qualitative research study that used nonrandom sampling. It included examples of many different family experiences, but the sample may somewhat over-represent some parents, usually mothers who were released, and it may underrepresent those who experienced longer detention or deportation.

The study found significant behavior changes after immigration raids occurred within a family. Children experienced a loss of appetite, experienced crying spells, and acted agitated and withdrawn. The report found that children who actually saw immigration raids occur in their homes had even greater challenges including; sleeping problems, changes in eating patterns, and fear and anxiety. Deportation represented a potentially permanent geographic separation of children from their parents. The research paper found many emotional effects described as; anxiety, depression, sadness, anger and fear which were reported by children who were impacted by raids. It provided recommendations that include advocating change in Congress with current immigration law to consider all affected in deportation raids. In addition, recommendations, rights and interests of children during deportation proceedings should be recognized by law. It recommended Congress create an alternative standard such that if psychological, economical or development hardships were to occur for U.S. citizen children of parents that have been deported, parents should be permitted to stay united with their family in the United States.

This research paper examined trauma found in children such as fear, anxiety and irritability. Furthermore it provided recommendations for changes in policy for Congress to consider the impact on the entire family unit when deportations occur. It provided clear detail of
how immigration raids affected our most vulnerable population of United States children. In addition it provided recommendations to advocate for those impacted by raids.


The study compiled data from the National Survey of Child and Adolescent Well-being (NSCAW), an inferential study of a nationally representative sample of children who were subjects of reports of maltreatment to child protective services (CPS) agencies between 1999-2000. The two-stage stratified sample identified the mental health needs and service utilization of Latino immigrants who came to the attention of the child welfare system, and compared those needs and service usage to those of children in U.S.-born Latino families. Immigrant children might be vulnerable to mental health concerns due to the stress experienced by immigrant families, as a result of immigration and acculturation. Immigrant families may experience multi-layered stressors such as financial challenges, loneliness, isolation, language barriers and acculturation stress along with a loss of established support systems. The study identified that parenting stress predicts child behavioral problems over time. Furthermore it emphasized social workers in the child welfare systems must understand the impact immigration has on families, which can be done through further learning in culture, immigration history and experiences with acculturation.

This article identified immigrant family system stressors and how the emotions of loneliness, isolation and financial challenges may be demonstrated in the child's behavior. In
addition it emphasized ways social workers can understand more about this population through cultural competency courses.


This exploratory study looked at the effects of worksite raids on children, adults and the community. The report found undocumented immigrants experienced trauma on a daily basis. In addition it identified the stress, which can be reinforced by their treatment of social institutions and everyday social influences, which can build up over time and may lead to diagnoses of Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), anxiety and substance abuse disorders. When immigration raids occurred it affected the entire family unit. It found that emotions such as fear, distrust, anxiety and depression were felt among most family members. The article expressed the need for trained professionals to identify and respond to potential PTSD resulting from worksite raids for all those affected by immigration raids.

The article found psychological effects identified in families who witnessed raids. They were described as emotions, which included anxiety, anger, distrust and PTSD. Furthermore it gave recommendations for social workers to advocate for human rights for all people. This article provided further evidence of the traumatizing psychological affects children may experience after witnessing immigration raids. Trained professionals working with this targeted population will build and establish trust and a good working alliance with children.
The purpose of the toolkit is to provide NASW chapters, members, and other entities policy information and tools to promote the competency of social workers in the immigration field, to fight discrimination against immigrants, and to take social and political action in support of the rights of immigrants. Immigrants face a series of stress-producing events that result in the need for assistance and support. As social workers, we must present a politically active, united front to stem the disappearance of services and resources and ensure equal protection from discriminating for all immigrants, refugees and undocumented individuals who come to live in the U.S. To do nothing is to ignore the core of who we are and what our profession stands for.

The toolkit provided a wealth of information looking at the topic of immigration through the lens of social workers’ core values of human rights and social justice. It provided support for social workers to be involved politically. The toolkit gave core information that may be used when advocating for children caught in the system of immigration enforcement and child welfare.


This residual estimation methodology estimated the size of the unauthorized immigrant population in March 2010 and provided estimates and trends for the status of children who have
parents that may be undocumented. The unauthorized immigrant population was calculated with data that was collected primarily from a Current Population Survey. It found that over the past decade, deportations have almost doubled reaching 400,000 in 2009. The analysis found that among all children of unauthorized immigrants - an estimated 5.5 million in 2010 - a growing share were born in the United States and therefore they are U.S. citizens by birthright.

This report provided statistical data demonstrating the significant increase in number of deportations over the last decade. This is crucial information to consider when looking at ways social workers should focus their awareness of this targeted group, especially when working with children and seeing how they have been psychologically influenced by the raids. The Pew Research Center estimated an increase of 19% by 2050 of foreign-born immigrants. The increase is important for social workers to be aware of as the demographics of the population change.


The manual provided by Appleseed helped community providers that service families with legal and financial issues who have been affected by deportation. Appleseed is a nonprofit network of 16 public interest justice centers in the United States and Mexico. The agency uncovers and corrects social injustices through legal, legislative and market-based structural reform. This manual addressed the needs of immigrants in three situations. The first is
preparing immigrants, which aided families with getting their finances secured and child custody arranged in advance in case they are deported. The second, supervised immigrants, applied to families who are facing deportation and are under tight time constraints: the guide assisted families with getting their finances in order in a timely manner. Third, detained immigrants applied to families who were being held under the Department of Homeland Security. These immigrants have the least amount of options to get their finances in order and maintain their parental rights. It helped families with drafting financial matters in advance, along with recommending immigrants grant power of attorney to someone they can trust, in case they get deported. The bilingual guide may help alleviate some financial stress on or before the deportation process.

While this source does not directly address the psychological impact of the raids, it does address financial insecurity as a primary cause of stress. As other articles will illustrate, the financial consequences of immigration raids can have a lasting and damaging effect, and this source provided tools to mitigate these impacts. While this is a novel view of the subject, it does not appear to address the most basic and fundamental needs of emotional security for the youth affected by the deportation of their parents.


The National Council of La Raza gathered information on the mental health issues facing Latinos in the United States through the development of a research-informed white paper. It
focused on six major issues affecting Latino mental health: depression, immigration and acculturation, chemical use and dependency, domestic violence, suicide, and depression and comorbidity. It projected that by the year 2030 Latinos would total more than 73 million and constitute 20.1% the U.S. population, making Latinos the fastest-growing racial/ethnic group in the country. The current system of mental health fails to provide for the vast majority of Latinos in need of care, and this failure is especially pronounced for immigrant Latinos, incarcerated Latinos, and Latino youth. In addition many Latino immigrants perceived the process of immigration to the U.S. as a traumatic experience that negatively affects their self-esteem and overall sense of identity. Due to the fact that a large proportion of Latino children are immigrants themselves or have immigrant parents, their adaptation to the U.S. merits attention.

This article linked the cultural stigma Latinos faced with a mental disorder such as depression. It suggested using a conceptual model that understands ethnic and racial minority groups. Equally important, it identified a critical need for an increased number of culturally-and linguistically-relevant Spanish-speaking mental health providers at all levels of mental health care.


The report consisted of three parts: interviews, focus groups and quantitative data collection. Applied Research Center (ARC) is the first national investigation on threats to families when immigration enforcement and the child welfare system intersect. ARC is a 30-
year-old organization that promoted solutions to racial injustices. The ARC research indicated that children of noncitizens are removed from the custody of their families at an increased rate. Furthermore they suggested that non-citizen immigrants are subjected to particular, deep systemic barriers to reunification. According to ARC, parents are given a set of reunification plans that they must meet prior to reuniting with their children. Often times these plans required parents to attend family therapy, parenting classes or home visiting programs. Most of these services are challenging for immigrant parents to attend from a detention center because of bans on access to services and social support systems as well as a systemic bias against immigrants. Nevertheless if court determines the parents are incompliant, the children are put into long term foster care. The report used several testimonials of parents’ stories whose children are currently in foster care, separated from their family because of immigration enforcement. Immigration policies and laws are based on the assumption that families will, and should, be united, whether or not parents are deported. Likewise, child welfare policy aims to reunify families whenever possible. In practice, however, mothers and fathers are detained and deported and their children are subjected to foster care and family separation can last for long periods of time. Many times, these children lose the opportunity to ever see their deported parents again when a juvenile dependency court terminates parental rights. As the federal government continues to expand its immigration enforcement infrastructure, and continues to detain and deport parents at historical levels, more families will face threats to family unity.

This article provided further evidence of the systemic barriers of families who are involved with the child welfare system. In addition it provided several stories of families that have been shattered due to deportation. It is important for social workers to be aware of the threats due to immigration raids, which ultimately impact the family unit. Furthermore it
provided policy recommendations for federal, state and local governments to create explicit policies to protect families from separation and facilitate family unity.


The focus of the quantitative study was to evaluate undergraduates' reactions to participating in research considered to exceed minimal risk compared with participating in research considered to pose only minimal risk. It assessed key areas of concern to Institutional Review Boards specifically, participants' positive and negative emotional reactions to surveys on "sensitive" topics and the perceived benefits and mental costs of participating in studies that use such surveys. This study surveyed 504 men and women recruited from the psychology subject pool at a Southwestern University. The mean age of the sample was 20.6 years; 68.5% of participants were women and 31.5% were men. Participants were assigned randomly to which survey they would complete. Both paper surveys took two hours to complete. It surveyed undergraduates on trauma and sex or measure of cognitive ability. The survey revealed that all participants ranked normal life stressor as more distressing than participating in the study. These results suggested there is minimal risk of surveys that are conducted on sensitive material. The survey found the research experience to be neutral and furthermore the participants indicated they would do the study again. In addition there is evidence that suggested there is no long term harm to participating in such research.
This article suggested it is not harmful to conduct interviews on sensitive material. This could be helpful to future working professionals, since there is a limited amount of research available regarding the psychological effects children may face due to immigration raids. It is likely more research may be conducted in the near future for this population. It provided evidence, which indicated most participants reported low levels of distress from participating in the trauma research. Further research with immigrant populations may provide evidence of their needs and assess ways social workers can best meet their needs.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the second Ethical Principle presented in the NASW (2008) Code of Ethics stated: "Social workers’ challenge social injustice." ("Ethical Principles," para. 3). The needs of the children in our society must be protected to uphold this principle. Children are our future, and how we nurture that future will have lasting social consequences. The literature investigated the potential ramifications on our most vulnerable population as a result of past and current immigration policy and enforcement. Any policy that produces anxiety, depression and anger in the most vulnerable members of our society is not achieving the goals established in our constitution. NASW (2008) Code of Ethics, section 6.04 Social and Political Action, requires social workers to address these inequalities.

The current body of research indicated the need for increased cultural competency training for social workers and community and faith based organizations. This training will increase awareness of historical events, barriers faced by current and former immigrants to the United States and the social norms for the cultures they are representing. This training will increase the competency of working professionals when aiding families who have been impacted
by raids. This training directly supports the NASW (2008) Code of Ethics section 1.04 Competence Social Workers "should provide services and represent themselves as competent only within the boundaries of their education"("Ethical Standards," para. 9). When working with children who are showing psychological effects such as emotional trauma, it will be most effective for a trained professional to be aware of cultural barriers and mindful of their distrust. It requires a long term commitment to build relationships with the individual and develop trust. Social justice for this population requires sincere compassion, understanding of cultural differences and norms and working alliances with a foundation of trust.

Additional efforts should be made by universities to attract and train minority social workers and mental health care professionals. Programs are required that teach cultural competency along with the core social work skills. These resources could ensure the application of the NASW (2008) Code of Ethics section 1.05 Cultural Competence and Social Diversity protect the children impacted. A social work program that focuses on the navigation of the intersection of child welfare and immigration policy is required to create specialists in this field. The program should require a minor in a foreign language to continue to build competency and open communication with the ever increasing diversity of the U.S. Population.

The humanitarian guidelines for ICE are not followed consistently across the nation, and the DHS does not have an official policy regarding placing children with undocumented relatives. The current ICE guidelines should be modified to include all worksite raids (including less than 25 employees) and other operations conducted outside of the workplace. To assure these guidelines are standardized and enforced congress should reexamine the Immigration Oversight and Fairness Act. According to the NASW (2008) Code of Ethics 5.01 (c) "social workers should contribute time and professional expertise to activities that promote respect for
the value, integrity and competence of the social work profession" ("Social Workers' Ethical Responsibilities to the Social Work Profession," para. 3). This legislation, introduced by Representative Lucille Roybal-Allard (D-CA), would insure conditions of detention centers are humane. The bill would also ensure basic needs, mental and physical, are met for detainees and their dependent children (Cervantes & Lincroft, 2010).

Additional policy is required to protect the needs of children and efforts made to safeguard the unity of families regardless of immigration status or actions required. Children should be permitted to stay with next-of-kin relatives, regardless of their documented status. In support of NASW (2008) Code of Ethics section 4.02 Discrimination stated "social workers should not practice, condone, facilitate, or collaborate with any of discrimination" (Social Workers’ Ethical Responsibilities as Professionals," para. 4). Children who have been impacted by immigration raids and now in the foster care system should be given dual citizenship. The Humane Enforcement and Legal Protection (HELP) for Separated Children Act sponsored by Representative Lynn Woolsey (D-CA) would implement reforms to protect families affected by immigration raids. It will require the Secretary of Homeland Security to compile an annual report on the impact of immigration enforcement on U.S. citizens and other lawfully present children (Cervantes & Lincroft, 2010).

The primary concern of the child welfare system is for the safety of children placed with undocumented relatives and the relative instability of these homes. In support of the NASW (2008) Code of Ethics section 6.01 Social Welfare, a thorough investigation should be completed into potential policy that would provide non-citizen primary care givers for U.S. citizen children, temporary work permits and a means to achieve citizenship or permanent legal residency. Citizen children that are impacted by raids should be provided U.S. passports and placed with
family in a foreign country, once that country has ensured safe living conditions. These measures will safeguard the continuity of the family and provide the child the opportunity to return to the U.S. in the future. This will also reduce the strain on the foster care system.

Finally, in support of the NASW (2008) Code of Ethics section 5.02 Evaluation and Research, it is recommended that further studies be done with the children impacted by immigration raids directly and children of undocumented immigrant parents. As the population of children with at least one undocumented immigrant parent swells beyond the current 5.5 million, understanding the needs and most effective treatments will be essential to ensuring these children are engaged in our society. A 10 year longitudinal study with data collected every 2 years from the sample population should be conducted to study children in first generation immigrant families to identify mental health needs and systems that enable greater success in school. To ensure sufficient sample size through the course of the study will require a significant number of participants across the nation. This study should seek to understand the impact that first generation immigrant children face when the parents are legal immigrants and compare to the needs and challenges of children with one or more undocumented parents. The longitudinal study will provide insight into the children's integration into the school systems and will provide greater data for determining the best method of providing assistance to these children to ensure social workers are equipped to support them.
References


